Peer Assistance and Review

History
Evaluation has been a major source of confrontation between teacher organizations and administrations throughout the nation. Columbus was not atypical. Although the contractual evaluation process was clearly defined, it was neither positive nor successful. As public concern about teacher quality grew, CEA leadership faced the question of what role teachers would play in the improvement of their profession. Borrowing heavily from a similar concept in Toledo, a joint CEA/Board committee designed the Peer Assistance and Review (PAR) Program. It was ratified by a 96 percent vote of CEA’s Legislative Assembly and a unanimous vote by the Columbus Board of Education. PAR Consulting Teachers are selected from the teaching staff of the district after an elaborate process of recommendations and interviews. Their training is an ongoing process. Consulting Teachers serve for a maximum of three consecutive years.

PAR is governed by a panel of seven people: four represent CEA and three are appointed by the superintendent. Because all decisions must pass by a two-thirds vote, panel members must work together. The chair alternates annually between the CEA President and an administrator. PAR is an example of cooperative effort between teachers and administration. In a system of nearly 5400 teachers, PAR has served approximately 6,000 teachers since its beginning in 1986 through the 1999-2000 school year.

Intern Program
The Intern Program is mandatory for all teachers newly hired by Columbus Public Schools, even those with previous experience. The PAR Panel assigns a teacher consultant (PAR Consulting Teacher) to each intern. The consulting teachers are released full-time from classroom assignments in order to visit interns assigned to them. Each consulting teacher devotes many hours to direct classroom observations and conferences. To meet individual needs, the number and length of visits may vary. Additionally, consulting teachers have district resources available to help new teachers begin their careers successfully.

During the year, PAR Consulting Teachers prepare at least one interim report for each intern. A final appraisal includes a recommendation on whether the intern should receive a contract for the next year. PAR Panel members who hear these evaluations make final employment recommendations to the superintendent.

Intervention Program
The Intervention Program is designed to assist experienced teachers who are having difficulty. An elaborate process of checks and balances governs the referral of a teacher to this program. A referral can be initiated by either an administrator or another teacher. These referrals must be approved by the principal, senior faculty representative, Association Building Council (ABC) and PAR Panel. A teacher may also self-refer to obtain PAR Program assistance.

Each ABC determines its own voting requirements (e.g., majority, unanimous or some other percentage) before making a referral decision in executive session.

Once a teacher is approved for intervention, a PAR Consulting Teacher is assigned. Since there is no time limit, assistance is continued as long as the teacher is progressing at an acceptable rate. Formal evaluations and/or Special Notice Evaluations are not conducted by administration while a teacher is in intervention.

### Intern Teacher Summary Chart

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/ Sex</th>
<th>Evaluated</th>
<th>Resigned</th>
<th>Nonrenewed</th>
<th>Resigned</th>
<th>Declined Contract</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 F</td>
<td>3,328</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>3,589</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 F</td>
<td>801</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>901</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 F</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>43</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 F</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 F</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 M</td>
<td>834</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>975</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 M</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>314</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 M</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 M</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 M</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTALS</strong></td>
<td><strong>5,300</strong></td>
<td><strong>215</strong></td>
<td><strong>175</strong></td>
<td><strong>171</strong></td>
<td><strong>5,861</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sex codes: F = female  M = male
Race codes: 1 = White; 2 = Black; 3 = Hispanic; 4 = Asian; 5 = American Indian/Alaskan Native

### Intervention Teacher Summary Chart

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/ Sex</th>
<th>Currently in Program</th>
<th>Released/ Good Standing</th>
<th>Released/ Poor Standing</th>
<th>Exited CPS While in System</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 F</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 F</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 F</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 F</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 F</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 M</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 M</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 M</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 M</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 M</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTALS</strong></td>
<td><strong>7</strong></td>
<td><strong>87</strong></td>
<td><strong>44</strong></td>
<td><strong>73</strong></td>
<td><strong>4</strong></td>
<td><strong>215</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sex codes: F = female  M = male
Race codes: 1 = White; 2 = Black; 3 = Hispanic; 4 = Asian; 5 = American Indian/Alaskan Native
Program Personnel and Overview

PAR Panel
- Administers the PAR Program
- Consists of seven members: four teachers and three administrators
- Selects PAR Consulting Teachers
- Meets with PAR Consulting Teachers periodically to receive reports
- Evaluates requests for intervention
- Makes personnel recommendations based on PAR Consulting Teacher's report
- Oversees training of PAR Consulting Teachers
- Panel chair alternates yearly between administration and CEA president

PAR Consulting Teachers
- Serve on a full-time basis
- Serve for a maximum of three years to maintain the “peer” concept
- Mentor colleagues by demonstrating, observing, conferencing, referring, providing and assisting
- Plan and present new teacher reception
- Plan and present a graduate-level Peer Assistance and Review/The Ohio State University course (PAR/OSU)
- Conduct workshops for new teachers on teaching performance, pupil relations and management activities
- Assess colleague performance and make recommendations to the PAR Panel regarding future employment
- Receive supplemental contract worth twenty percent of base salary

PAR Program Overview
The Columbus Education Association and the Columbus Public Schools have developed and implemented a program in which highly successful teachers provide assistance to new teachers and to experienced teachers who are having serious difficulties. The primary goal of this program is to provide help to teachers entering the profession and to improve the performance of an experienced teacher who is not performing at an acceptable level.

- A seven member panel directs the PAR program. CEA appoints four members of the PAR Panel and the Superintendent appoints three.
- The PAR Panel selects the teachers (PAR Consulting Teachers) who will be working with the intern (beginning) teachers and with any other teachers identified by the Panel for assistance from a PAR Consulting Teacher.
- Newly-employed teachers are considered intern teachers and will be assigned to a PAR Consulting Teacher for their first year.
- Experienced teachers assigned to the intervention segment of the PAR Program will continue to receive assistance until the PAR Consulting Teacher determines that no further assistance is needed or will be productive.
- The contractual and legal rights of intern teachers and experienced teachers assigned to the PAR Program for intervention will be honored.
- Program support will be furnished by the Board of Education.
- The PAR Program may be terminated any time by either the Superintendent or the CEA President with thirty days written notice to the other party.

Protections and Conclusions

Article 1403 Reform Panel, continued
1403.06 The panel shall begin operations with the ratification of this Agreement and shall continue in effect with full authority as provided herein and without regard to the term of this Agreement, until either party notifies the other in writing of its desire to terminate the panel. In the event of such notification, as with the PAR Panel, the authority of the Reform Panel shall be terminated thirty (30) days after such notification. All variances to this Agreement in effect at the time of termination shall be automatically canceled as shall all variances in practices required by the panel except those related to the implementation of state-mandated Competency Based Education or other legally mandated programs.
1403.07 During the thirty (30) day period between notification of cancellation and termination, the panel shall make every effort to provide for an orderly transition period by attempting to minimize problems resulting from the cancellation of variances. The parties recognize that educational sensitivity and personal considerations will not permit some variances to be phased out during this thirty (30) day transition period. No later than the date of termination of the panel, the Board will provide the Association with a timeline for completing the cancellation of any variances that cannot sensibly be completed during the thirty (30) day transition period. In addition, representatives of the Board and Association shall meet promptly and as necessary to discuss such orderly transition and to determine if the parties wish to retain any of the variances. Any variances to this Agreement which the parties wish to maintain must be processed as amendments to this Agreement.
1403.08 The Reform Panel shall be co-chaired by the Association President, or designee, and the Superintendent, or designee. The Reform Panel shall be made up of an equal number of teacher representatives and administration representatives.

Conclusion
We have compiled this packet of information because we believe that our PAR Program works. We understand the concerns voiced by many of our colleagues about taking such bold steps to improve and protect public education. The information enclosed is brief and does not reflect the entire range of our reform program in Columbus. The best way to learn more about this peer assistance and review program is to actually see it in action. Former NEA President Bob Chase spent three days observing our PAR Consulting on their rounds. He was apparently impressed enough with their performance to support a resolution at the 1997 Representative Assembly reversing NEA's previous opposition to peer assistance and review.

Thank you for showing an interest in our program and in improving public education ... for children.
On-Going Reflection

A program like PAR demands high levels of collaboration, communication and trust. Absent these conditions, it would be difficult to sustain a program where teachers and their association put so much at risk. In addition, such a program is only one of the tools needed to advance the agenda of improving the educational environment and improving student performance while protecting teachers’ rights. For this reason, the Columbus Education Association and the Columbus Public Schools have entered into an agreement creating a body that can oversee proposals for innovation, allowing contract waivers where convincing arguments are brought forward to do so and sending eager administrative/staff planning teams back to the drawing board when unacceptable flaws are found. Like peer assistance and review, this element called the Reform Panel also requires trust and collaboration. If both management and labor are not deriving benefits from such collaborative efforts, it is impossible for those efforts to produce positive change in the classrooms. For this reason, the following contract language has been created.

Special attention should be given to item 1203.06 which allows either administration or the union to unilaterally cancel either the PAR Program or the Reform Panel by submitting a written 30-day notice to the other party.

Article 1403 Reform Panel

1403.01 The Reform Panel shall facilitate the implementation of (a) initiatives directed at the improvement of teaching and learning conditions in the district, (b) requests for variances that may be submitted by school based shared decision-making cabinets, and (c) instructional and curricular functions are assumed by such cabinet and the ABC has been so advised by the cabinet. In such a third parties.

1403.02 The panel shall have the authority to grant and cancel variances to this Agreement and shall have the authority to require variances in practice in one or more schools. The panel may grant variances for a specific period of time; if not, the variances shall continue until changed. School based shared decision-making cabinets may apply for renewal of variances which are scheduled to expire. Approval by the panel shall require a majority vote of the panel membership. Such approval shall not be unreasonably denied. Variances from this Agreement shall also require the approval of the Superintendent and Association President.

1403.03 All new programs or other initiatives approved by the panel which may result in variances in practice and all variances and all cancellations of variances approved by the panel shall be in writing and shall be signed by the panel chairperson, the Association President and the Superintendent. Any internal processing requirements by the separate parties prior to panel approval shall be left to the separate parties.

1403.04 The panel shall establish application forms and procedures for requesting variances. Such procedures must not require a majority vote by teachers in a building in support of the variance exceeding two-thirds (2/3). Such procedures must be consistent with this Agreement. In addition, to assist in the work of the panel, it shall form and direct committees, including a committee on state-mandated Competency Based Education. If a request for a variance has sufficient support from the building, the requested variance shall be added to the Reform Panel agenda for the next meeting.

1403.05 Notwithstanding Section 202.02 of this Agreement, if there is a panel-authorized shared decision-making cabinet in a school, the Association Building Council shall continue to perform the duties and functions of the ABC as provided in this Agreement, except when any of those duties and functions are assumed by such cabinet and the ABC has been so advised by the cabinet. In such a school the ABC shall be made up of the elected teacher members of the cabinet and the senior faculty representative, who shall serve on both. The cabinet shall have no authority with regard to the PAR Program.

The PAR Program

Columbus Public Schools continuously strives to drive the highest possible quality of education. For students to succeed in learning, teachers must succeed in teaching. The PAR Program has been designed to improve the quality of instruction by assuring that all teachers are experiencing professional success. The program has two components.

Components

• Prior to working with a teacher newly identified for intervention, the consulting teacher will meet with the building principal to discuss the case. The building principal will identify problems and offer suggestions for improvement.
• The consulting teacher will meet with the participating teacher to discuss the PAR Program intervention and goal setting process.
• The consulting teacher will observe the participating teacher and assess teaching performance for the purpose of determining performance goals.
• The building principal, consulting teacher and program participant will meet to establish specific performance goals necessary to raise the participant’s performance to an acceptable level. If specific subject or program-related concerns are involved, program consultants and supervisors may also be included in this conference.
• During the participant’s stay in the PAR Program, the consulting teacher will frequently observe the participant, having both pre-observation and post-observation conferences as often as practical. Subject area consultants and special program area supervisors may be included as frequently as deemed necessary by the consulting teacher.
• The consulting teacher will communicate regularly with the building principal regarding the progress of the program participant and to discuss reports prior to submitting them to the PAR Panel.
• The PAR Panel may call on building principals, PAR Consulting Teachers, or other school system personnel to participate in discussions regarding the progress and program status of PAR Program participants.

Relationships

- Prior to working with a teacher newly identified for intervention, the consulting teacher will meet with the building principal to discuss the case. The building principal will identify problems and offer suggestions for improvement.
- The consulting teacher will meet with the participating teacher to discuss the PAR Program intervention and goal setting process.
- The consulting teacher will observe the participating teacher and assess teaching performance for the purpose of determining performance goals.
- The building principal, consulting teacher and program participant will meet to establish specific performance goals necessary to raise the participant’s performance to an acceptable level. If specific subject or program-related concerns are involved, program consultants and supervisors may also be included in this conference.
- During the participant’s stay in the PAR Program, the consulting teacher will frequently observe the participant, having both pre-observation and post-observation conferences as often as practical. Subject area consultants and special program area supervisors may be included as frequently as deemed necessary by the consulting teacher.
- The consulting teacher will communicate regularly with the building principal regarding the progress of the program participant and to discuss reports prior to submitting them to the PAR Panel.
- The PAR Panel may call on building principals, PAR Consulting Teachers, or other school system personnel to participate in discussions regarding the progress and program status of PAR Program participants.
The PAR Panel
The PAR Program Panel is composed of four members appointed by the Columbus Education Association and three members appointed by the Superintendent. The Chair will rotate annually between the two parties, with a panel year defined as August 1 - July 31. To meet, two-thirds of the members of the Panel must be present.

The major responsibilities of the PAR Panel are:
• PAR Program: The PAR Panel determines the specific details of the PAR Program. The Panel establishes operational procedures, develops all necessary forms and documents, and generally manages the PAR Program.
• PAR Consulting Teachers: The Panel selects the PAR Consulting Teachers based on criteria established elsewhere in this document. These teachers will be trained to offer peer assistance and will be in-serviced on the specific details of the PAR Program. The Panel will continuously monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of PAR Consulting Teachers and will make recommendations to the Director of Personnel Services regarding their continuation in the PAR Program.
• PAR Program Participants / Intern Participants: The Panel has developed specific guidelines for participation in this segment of the PAR Program.
• Intervention Participants: The Panel has also developed guidelines for participation in this segment of the PAR Program and has created a PAR Intervention Referral Form. If the Panel votes (2/3 of the members present) to include a teacher in the PAR Program, the Panel will notify the teacher and the building principal and assign a PAR Consulting Teacher.
• Status Reports and Evaluations: The PAR Panel will monitor the progress of each participant by reviewing status reports and evaluations regularly submitted by PAR Consulting Teachers. Except in very special circumstances, PAR Program participants will not be given Special Notice Evaluations while they are in the program.
• Intern Program: The Panel has developed a schedule for receiving and reviewing evaluations of interns.

Coursework
PAR Consulting Teachers collaboratively design and facilitate a three-hour graduate course offered annually during winter quarter through The Ohio State University. Entry-year teachers who elect to take the class meet weekly with the PAR Consulting Teachers, Ohio State faculty and other experts invited to address topics pertinent to beginning professionals. Presenters may include personnel from the district or from the union office. Course requirements are carefully structured to be practical and applicable.

Course topics may include the following:
• Teaching in the Urban Setting
• Effective Teaching: Management Strategies
• Mini-Sessions
• Professional Observations
• Dealing With Anger, Conflict and Violence
• Examples of Effective Teaching
• Resources and Their Application
• Kids Between the Cracks
• Self Assessment and Reflection/Processing Observations
• The Educator as a Professional/Licensure/Certification

PAR Consulting Teachers plan and execute other programs for teachers new to Columbus Public Schools. The Columbus Education Association sponsors an orientation program in the fall. In this social setting, new teachers are welcomed to the district. This event is held in the evening a few days before school begins and is an opportunity to meet the CEA officers, members of the CEA Board of Governors, administrative officials and Board of Education members.

The year's activities culminate in a spring celebration at which consulting teachers join the interns in celebrating their first successful year in Columbus Public Schools.
The Ohio State University

Any conversation about the quality of teachers will eventually contain a teacher training element. Answering the question, “Who trained, licensed and hired all the bad teachers?” can provide hours of heated debate. The Ohio State University College of Education has been at the forefront of reforming the processes by which their education graduates are trained. Under the leadership of former Dean Nancy Zimpher, the education college at OSU has worked closely with the district and the teachers union to ensure that every classroom will have a caring and competent teacher. A wide array of collaborations have been created to improve the quality of educator training. PAR is only one of these efforts.

Training for PAR Consulting Teachers

An integral part of professional development for PAR Consulting Teachers is the opportunity to meet regularly with university faculty to discuss issues related to entry-year teachers and mentoring. Topics are identified by consulting teachers at the beginning of each quarter and may include the following:

- Developmental Stages of Teachers
- Characteristics of Consulting Teachers
- Performance Terms
- Formal Case Study Presentations
- Systematic Observation Techniques
- Dealing with Difficult Professionals
- Conferencing Strategies
- Developing a Supportive Collegial Atmosphere
- The “Language” of Report Writing
- Evaluation Standards

This ongoing professional development provides a forum for consulting teachers to discuss concerns and issues regarding their entry-year teachers and their own growth.

Workshop Training for Interns

The PAR Program provides professional growth opportunities for all entry-year teachers and those new to teaching in the Columbus Public Schools. PAR Consulting Teachers plan a series of six workshops throughout the school year. Attendance is voluntary, but participating interns may receive up to two hours of graduate credit for participating.

Topics for the workshops are specifically designed to meet the needs of teachers new to the Columbus district. They may include:

- Creating a Positive Classroom Culture
- Instructional Strategies
- Cooperative Discipline
- Valuing Diversity
- Individualizing Instruction for Students with Special Needs
- Sharing Success Stories from the First Year of Teaching

The PAR Consulting Teacher

Each consulting teacher works with both intern and intervention teachers.

Selection Criteria

Criteria for selection of PAR Consulting Teachers will include the following:

- Taught in the Columbus Public Schools for a minimum of five (5) years.
- Demonstrated outstanding classroom teaching ability.
- Demonstrated talent in written and oral communications.
- Demonstrated ability to work cooperatively and effectively with other professional staff members.
- Extensive knowledge of a variety of classroom management and instructional techniques.

Selection Process

The PAR Panel has developed an application form for the position of PAR Consulting Teacher, and the Director of Personnel Services directs the posting of the position in all buildings. Applications will be accepted at any time and kept on file for future consideration based on the expansion and/or needs of the program.

In addition to submitting a properly completed application form, each applicant is required to have the following documents submitted directly to the Director of Personnel Services:

- A reference from his/her building principal or immediate supervisor if the teacher is not assigned to a school building.
- A reference from his/her senior faculty representative.
- References from two other teachers from his/her building or program if the teacher is not assigned to a school building.
- The President of the CEA and the Director of Personnel Services will review the applications and identify teachers for consideration by the PAR Panel. The Panel will select consulting teachers from this group of applicants. All applications and references will be treated with the strictest confidentiality.

Assignment Status

Applicants who are not accepted as consulting teachers will be notified. Those who are selected by the PAR Panel as consulting teachers will:

- Continue in current assignment until the PAR Panel determines the need for a consulting teacher.
- Identification by the Panel as a consulting teacher is not a guarantee of active assignment.
- If assigned, work full-time as a consulting teacher until the PAR Panel determines the service is no longer needed. Generally, assignments will be for the school year and will not continue more than three consecutive years.
- Have a right to return to their previous teaching assignment if their assignment as a consulting teacher is for less than a full school year.
- Consulting teachers who are on active assignment for a full school year or more will be given every available consideration in their teaching assignment.
- Receive a supplemental contract for service as an assigned consulting teacher at the rate of twenty percent of base salary per year. Partial years will be prorated. Supplemental contracts held by consulting teachers at the time of assignment will be paid if the services under the contract have begun. For purposes of determining years of continuous service under supplemental contracts, years served as a PAR Consulting Teacher may be applied to either Group A or B in Article 905.01 of the Master Agreement.
The PAR Program Participant

**Intern Participants**

All newly-hired teachers who have not previously participated in the PAR Program will be designated interns for one year for the purpose of professional development and evaluation. The PAR Panel will have the authority to exclude a teacher from the program because of special job-related considerations.

**Intervention Participants**

The process of enrolling a teacher as a PAR Program participant is initiated whenever a building principal and/or senior faculty representative (SrFR) believes that a teacher in his/her building is experiencing serious difficulty in the performance of professional duties and could benefit by intervention from a PAR Consulting Teacher. If the building principal is the initiating party, he/she should call the Director of Personnel Services and recommend the teacher as a candidate for the PAR Program. If the SrFR is the initiating party, he/she should call the CEA President with a similar recommendation.

If, after consultation, the Director of Personnel Services and the CEA President determine that the views of the building principal and the senior faculty representative concur and that substantive cause for concern exists, then the senior faculty representative will be notified to take the recommendation to the Association Building Council (ABC).

The ABC will meet in executive session as provided in Article 202.05 of the Master Agreement to consider the recommendation. The executive session may be part of a regularly scheduled ABC meeting, or the chairperson of the ABC may call a special meeting for the purpose of discussing this matter only. In the case of a special meeting, the chairperson will notify all ABC members of the date and time of the meeting at least five (5) school days in advance. Executive sessions are limited to the five (5) members of the ABC except in buildings or units that have elected to expand the size of their ABC according to contractual limits.

If the ABC decides that the teacher being discussed should be recommended as a PAR Program participant, the Recommendation for Intervention form will be completed, signed by both the building principal and the senior faculty representative, and forwarded to the PAR Panel.

Teachers not assigned to a regular school staff may be recommended for intervention by their program supervisor. The recommendation should go to the Director of Personnel Services. The remainder of the process will be similar to that above except that the CEA President will act in place of the Association Building Council.

The PAR Panel will review and vote on the recommendation. If the panel votes to include a teacher in the PAR Program, the panel will notify the teacher and the building principal. The teacher’s participation is not voluntary. The PAR Panel will assign a PAR Consulting Teacher to the new program participant.

---

**Goal-Setting Agreement**

between ______________________________________ Teacher
______________________________________ PAR Consulting Teacher

**Objective**

1. To utilize a broader variety of instructional strategies that increase opportunities for student learning.
2. To maintain positive classroom management strategies and discipline methodologies.

**Teacher Activities**

1. Develop and utilize a lesson format that includes objectives in terms of student behavior, linking from previous student knowledge, focusing on teacher/student interaction, reviewing, and closing.
2. To employ a variety of instructional strategies in each class period.
3. Communicate with other teachers within the building to link classroom activities.

**Consultant Activities**

1. Continue to observe and provide feedback with suggestions.
2. Provide a variety of effective instructional strategies.
3. Provide a professional observation to the Blank High "Classroom of Tomorrow."

Follow-up conference scheduled for: ________________________________

Teacher Signature ____________________________ Date ____________________________

PAR Consulting Teacher Signature ____________________________ Date ____________________________
**Guidelines for Intervention**

Guidelines for principals and senior faculty representatives in relation to teacher identification for intervention assistance within the PAR Program:

The Peer Assistance and Review Program (PAR Program) has as one of its major components a plan to assist experienced teachers who are experiencing serious difficulties in their teaching assignments. This assistance is to be provided by a peer referred to as a Consulting Teacher. This PAR Consulting Teacher will work with the referred teacher until such time as he or she determines that the teacher is either working successfully and needs no further assistance or determines the referred teacher is not showing reasonable growth in relation to the assistance provided. It is important that everyone understands that the major purpose of intervention is to assist the experienced teacher to overcome deficiencies and again become a successful teacher.

The building principal and the senior faculty representative (SrFR) are the key people in the school to provide input as to which teachers should be referred for assistance. The process of enrolling a teacher as a PAR Program participant is initiated whenever a building principal and/or a senior faculty representative believes that a teacher in his/her building is experiencing serious difficulty in the performance of professional duties and could benefit by intervention from a PAR Consulting Teacher.

If the building principal is the initiating party, he/she should call the Director of Personnel Services and recommend the teacher as a candidate for the PAR Program. If the senior faculty representative is the initiating party, he/she should call the CEA President with a similar recommendation. Conversation between the SrFR and principal about the possibility of recommending a teacher for the PAR Program must be treated in a very confidential and professional manner.

If, after consultation, the Director of Personnel Services and the CEA President determine that the views of the building principal and the senior faculty representative concur and that substantive cause for concern exists, then the senior faculty representative will be notified to take the recommendation to the Association Building Council (ABC).

The ABC will meet to consider the recommendation. The executive session may be a part of a regularly scheduled ABC meeting, or the chairperson of the ABC may call a special meeting for the purpose of discussing this matter only. In the case of a special meeting, the chairperson will notify all ABC members of the date and time of the meeting at least five (5) school days in advance. Executive sessions are limited to the five (5) members of the ABC except in buildings or units that have elected to expand the size of their ABC according to contractual limits.

If the ABC decides that the teacher being discussed should be recommended as a PAR Program Participant, the “Recommendation for Intervention” form will be completed, signed by both the building principal and the senior faculty representative, and forwarded to the PAR Panel. Teachers not assigned to a regular school staff may be recommended for intervention by their program supervisor. The recommendation should go to the Director of Personnel Services. The remainder of the process will be similar to that above except that the CEA President will act in place of the Association Building Council.

The PAR Panel will review and vote on the recommendation. If the panel votes to include a teacher in the program, the panel will notify the teacher and the building principal. The teacher’s participation is not voluntary. The panel will assign a PAR Consulting Teacher to the new program participant.

---

**Principal’s Summary Intern Report**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principal’s Summary Intern Report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intern: ________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principal: ______________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Days Absent: ____________________________</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PRINCIPAL’S RATINGS:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Willingness to cooperate to achieve school and system goals</th>
<th>Successful</th>
<th>Unsuccessful</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adherence to district policies, procedures, and regulations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adherence to building policies, procedures, and regulations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperative approach toward parents and the community</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supports school activities through active participation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accurate and punctual in completing records, reports, etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of effective discipline</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attendance and promptness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**COMMENTS:**

Principal’s Signature __________________________ Date ____________

Intern’s Signature __________________________ Date ____________

To be forwarded to the Consulting Teacher and attached to the Intern Appraisal Summary Report.
Potential Characteristics

Staff members are often aware of when a colleague is having serious difficulty. The more common indicators of performance problems may include any of the following:

- Serious discipline and classroom control problems
- Frequent conflicts with students
- Nolgy, unproductive classroom atmosphere
- Children frequently out of the classroom
- Total lack of student interest in classroom activities
- High incidence of discipline referrals
- Unduly harsh and unreasonable treatment of students
- Frequent parent complaints and difficulty resolving problems with parents
- Lack of planning and preparation for instruction
- Disorganized about meeting professional responsibilities
- Extremes in grading as reflected in grade inflation or excessive failure rates
- Lack of student growth and achievement
- Tardiness and high absence rates
- Sarcasm and/or demeaning comments to students
- General negativism toward all facets of the job
- Difficulty with routine tasks
- Failure to comply with district policies and administrative requests

It is important to understand that teachers referred for assistance are not categorized as unsuccessful teachers who must be removed from the profession. Teachers referred to the program are viewed as valued professionals. Through the PAR Program, resources are provided to enable these teachers to improve classroom performance to a successful standard. The PAR Panel, composed of four members appointed by the CEA and three members appointed by the Superintendent, is charged with the responsibility of managing the PAR Intervention Component. The panel will monitor the progress of each participant by reviewing status reports regularly submitted by the PAR Consulting Teacher. When the PAR Panel receives a final status report from a consultant teacher stating that the PAR Intervention participant needs no further assistance or that further assistance will not be productive, a written report of the participant's performance status is completed and signed by all seven PAR Panel members. In turn, the co-chairs of the PAR Panel have a conference with the participant to review the report and receive his/her signature. Signing the report does not necessarily mean agreement, but rather that he/she has reviewed and received a copy of the report. A signed copy of the report is forwarded to the Director of Personnel Services for inclusion in the participant's personnel file.
Intern Interim Report

**Interim Interim Report**

**S. S. Number**

**Building/Grade/Subject/Position**

**Evaluation Code**

S - Successful
C - Area of Concern; Inconsistent performance, needs attention
D - Seriously Deficient; Immediate growth needs to occur

1. **Teaching Performance** - The intern writes daily lesson plans that align with the State Learning Competencies (SLC) / current curriculum guide; implements classroom teaching strategies, activities and assessments that promote student achievement of the State Learning Competencies (SLC) / current curriculum guide; maintains a safe, friendly and mutually respectful environment conducive to student learning and development; uses writing, listening and speaking skills to convey the instructional material in a developmentally appropriate manner; and demonstrates mastery of the subject matter to achieve the instructional objective.

   **Comments:**

2. **Pupil Relations** - The intern demonstrates a professional interest in students and shows concern for their safety and well-being; treats all students fairly and is cognizant of the uniqueness of the individual; and selects activities, strategies, assignments and assessments to allow for the growth and development of all students.

   **Comments:**

3. **Management Activities** - The intern effectively manages student discipline and overall student safety; allocates time for the purpose of maximizing the learning process; effectively develops, implements and manages records, reports and student work; and manages classroom facilities, materials and equipment in a safe and organized manner.

   **Comments:**

4. **Overall Value to the School Program** - The intern conveys clear and accurate knowledge of the school's mission statement; has a positive impact on the school program; and promptly and completely complies with directives, school rules and reasonable requests.

   **Comments:**

5. **Personal Characteristics** - The intern demonstrates professional attitude, integrity, conduct and appearance within the educational environment.

   **Comments:**

6. **Staff Relations** - The intern exhibits a collegial and professional relationship with all staff.

   **Comments:**

7. **Parent-Community Relations** - The intern demonstrates the ability to convey the school's mission, objectives, program and policies to parents and the community, and maintains positive and productive parent contact.

   **Comments:**

8. **Professional Growth** - The intern utilizes opportunities for professional study and growth and employs ongoing reflection throughout the teaching/learning process.

   **Comments:**

**INTERN COMMENTS:**

**Mentoring Record:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intern</th>
<th>Consulting Teacher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**INTERIM COMMENTS:**

**Date of Conference**

**Intern Signature**

**Consulting Teacher Signature**

cc: Intern / Principal / Consulting Teacher

**Contract language**

Below is copy of text from the evaluation section of the Agreement Between the Columbus Board of Education and The Columbus Education Association. This contract language has been developed over the last few contracts since the creation of the PAR Program.

**Article 401.14**

A. The evaluation and any related actions involving teachers during the period of assignment to the Peer Assistance and Review Program (PAR Program) shall be in accordance with the procedures established by the PAR Program Panel rather than in accordance with the provisions contained in this Article 401. Such related actions shall include action by the Board based on recommendations by the PAR Program Panel regarding intern teachers and action by the Board based on reports by the PAR Program Panel regarding teachers who have been previously assigned to the PAR Program for intervention.

B. The provisions of this Article 401 shall apply to teachers assigned to the PAR Program only in the event of administrative action which is not in accordance with the PAR Program Panel procedures. Such administrative action shall only be initiated where the basis for such action is primarily related to concerns other than classroom teaching performance.

C. Any teacher may request to be assigned to the PAR Program by submitting a written request to the Association President. If the teacher requesting assignment to the PAR Program has been given a Notice of Special Evaluation and has more than five (5) years of continuous Columbus teaching experience, such teacher shall be accepted into the intervention phase of the PAR Program. The final determination of whether to admit a teacher with five (5) or less years of continuous Columbus teaching experience to the PAR Program will be made by the PAR Panel.

D. Teachers who have all successful ratings on their most recent evaluation form shall not be recommended for PAR Intervention by an administrative-initiated referral unless the following has been provided:

1. A serious concern(s) has been identified by the principal or evaluating supervisor and a conference has been held with the affected teacher where the serious concern(s) is identified and discussed with said teacher.

2. The principal or evaluating supervisor has provided suggestions and/or assistance to the affected teacher to correct the serious concern(s).

3. If the serious concern(s) has not been resolved, a follow-up conference has been held with the affected teacher to inform said teacher and, if it is the intention of the principal or evaluating supervisor to recommend the teacher for PAR Intervention, to so inform the teacher during this conference.

4. A teacher shall not be represented or accompanied by a representative of any employee organization in any conferences required in 401.14D above.

**Master Agreement**

The Columbus Education Association. This contract language has been developed over the last few contracts since the creation of the PAR Program.
### PAR Intervention Referral Process

1. **Teacher initiated concern**
   - CEA President
   - Executive Director Personnel Services

2. **Self-referral by letter**
   - Discuss
   - Upon concurrence
   - CEA President
   - Senior FR convenes ABC Executive Session

3. **Self-referrals to directly to PAR Panel**
   - Complete referral form with Senior FR and Principal signatures
   - PAR Panel Chairperson Education Center
   - PAR Panel assigns Consulting Teacher for assistance and monitor progress mandated report

Special Notice Evaluation is an alternative for administrator use in the absence of agreement for PAR referral.

### Teaching Performance Rubric

#### Pupil Relations

**Pupil Relations - Professional Interest in Students**
- The instructor demonstrates a professional interest in students and shows concern for their safety and well-being.

**Pupil Relations - Impartiality**
- The instructor treats all students fairly and is cognizant of the uniqueness of the individual.

**Pupil Relations - Promotes Student Growth and Development**
- The instructor selects activities, strategies, assignments, and assessments to allow for the growth and development of all students.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCORE</th>
<th>PROFESSIONAL INTEREST IN STUDENTS</th>
<th>IMPARTIALITY</th>
<th>PROMOTES STUDENT GROWTH AND DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>• Consistently maintains a safe and nurturing environment • Consistently demonstrates strategies to learn students' individual needs, abilities and interests</td>
<td>• Consistently treats all students in a fair and supportive manner • Consistently considers individuality by incorporating diverse issues and discussions into the curriculum with regard to gender, class, intellect, culture and race</td>
<td>• Consistently utilizes a variety of assessment strategies to accommodate for student differences and needs • Consistently varies activities, strategies, and assignments to accommodate individual learning styles and development • Consistently engages students of various levels of ability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>• Generally maintains a safe and nurturing environment • Generally demonstrates strategies to learn students' individual needs, abilities and interests</td>
<td>• Generally treats all students in a fair and supportive manner • Generally considers individuality by incorporating diverse issues and discussions into the curriculum with regard to gender, class, intellect, culture and race</td>
<td>• Generally utilizes a variety of assessment strategies to accommodate for student differences and needs • Generally varies activities, strategies, and assignments to accommodate individual learning styles and development • Generally engages students of various levels of ability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>• Inconsistently maintains a safe and nurturing environment • Inconsistently demonstrates strategies to learn students' individual needs, abilities and interests</td>
<td>• Inconsistently treats all students in a fair and supportive manner • Inconsistently considers individuality by incorporating diverse issues and discussions into the curriculum with regard to gender, class, intellect, culture and race</td>
<td>• Inconsistently utilizes a variety of assessment strategies to accommodate for student differences and needs • Inconsistently varies activities, strategies, and assignments to accommodate individual learning styles and development • Inconsistently engages students of various levels of ability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>• Fails to maintain a safe and nurturing environment • Fails to demonstrate strategies to learn students' individual needs, abilities and interests</td>
<td>• Fails to treat all students in a fair and supportive manner • Fails to consider individuality by incorporating diverse issues and discussions into the curriculum with regard to gender, class, intellect, culture and race</td>
<td>• Fails to utilize a variety of assessment strategies to accommodate for student differences and needs • Fails to vary activities, strategies, and assignments to accommodate individual learning styles and development • Fails to engage students of various levels of ability</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Teaching Performance Rubric

This teaching performance rubric is an evaluation tool designed to assess interns (entry-year teachers) in the PAR Program. Its foundation is based on the eight performance terms described on page 15.

For every performance term, a general statement was created which broadly defines the standards of each term. A sample statement in the area of Pupil Relations is printed below.

Pupil Relations
The intern demonstrates a professional interest in students and shows concern for their safety and well-being; treats all students fairly and is cognizant of the uniqueness of the individual; and selects activities, strategies, assignments, and assessments to allow for the growth and development of all students.

That term is then subheaded with objectives which further explain the performance term.

Explanation of Performance Term
Professional Interest in Students - The intern demonstrates a professional interest in students and shows concern for their safety and well-being.

Impartiality - The intern treats all students fairly and is cognizant of the uniqueness of the individual.

Student Growth and Development - The intern selects activities, strategies, assignments, and assessments to allow for the growth and development of all students.

To further assist PAR Consulting Teachers in assessing intern performance, indicators of successful teaching were developed.

Indicators of Successful Teaching
Pupil Relations
• greeting students at the door
• positive interaction with students
• positive non-verbal behavior
• display of student work
• positive acknowledgement of all students
• politically correct language
• absence of favoritism
• respect toward all students
• individualized instruction
• active listening

On the next page, sample cells of the teaching performance rubric in the area of Pupil Relations are exhibited. The rubric is divided into four levels (4 being the highest level of performance, 1 the lowest).
PAR Panel Report Sample

PAR Panel Report
Jane Doe
June 11, 2000

Ms. Doe was teaching a first/second grade split at Blank Elementary School in May of 1998 when she received an administratively initiated referral to PAR. She had been teaching in the Columbus Public School district for 26 years and had an additional 10 years of experience outside the district.

For the 1998-1999 school year, Ms. Doe transferred to Alternate Elementary School and was assigned to teach third grade. Angela Smith was assigned as her PAR Consulting Teacher in September, 1998.

The principal at Alternate reported that Ms. Doe was uncooperative with staff and parents. She made degrading remarks to students and had a lack of organizational skills. These concerns resulted in the referral to PAR.

In February 1999, the Consulting Teacher reported that while Ms. Doe exhibited an ultra-traditional teaching style, she had not witnessed degrading remarks toward students. The consultant did have concerns that Ms. Doe was not addressing the curriculum guide, especially in science, on a regular basis.

By June, 1999, there were no class difficulties to report and no concerns from the principal. Ms. Doe was including instruction in science on a more regular basis. Instruction was reported to be very teacher oriented with minimal student interaction. Sustained improvement was reported in October 1999.

In June 2000, the Consulting Teacher reported that observations had shown that Ms. Doe was improving her pupil relations skills and student expectations. She related to each student directly and focused more on problem-solving. The Consulting Teacher feels that Ms. Doe is performing at a satisfactory level and recommends a positive release from PAR Intervention.

The PAR Panel concurs with the Consulting Teacher's recommendation to discontinue intervention services at this time. We extend to Ms. Doe our best wishes for success in her teaching career.

Respectfully submitted by the Peer Assistance and Review Panel.

cc: Personnel file

My signature below is acknowledgment that I have read and received a copy of this report.

Date

**Teaching Performance**
The intern writes daily lesson plans that align with the State Learning Competencies (SLC) / current curriculum guide; implements classroom teaching strategies, activities and assessments that promote student achievement of the State Learning Competencies (SLC) / current curriculum guide; maintains a safe, friendly and mutually respectful environment conducive to student learning and development; uses writing, listening and speaking skills to convey the instructional material in a developmentally appropriate manner; and demonstrates mastery of the subject matter to achieve the instructional objective.

**Pupil Relations**
The intern demonstrates a professional interest in students and shows concern for their safety and well-being; treats all students fairly and is cognizant of the uniqueness of the individual; and selects activities, strategies, assignments and assessments to allow for the growth and development of all students.

**Management Activities**
The intern effectively manages student discipline and overall student safety; allocates time for the purpose of maximizing the learning process; effectively develops, implements and manages records, reports and student work; and manages classroom facilities, materials and equipment in a safe and organized manner.

**Overall Value to the School Program**
The intern conveys clear and accurate knowledge of the school’s mission statement; has a positive impact on the school program; and promptly and completely complies with directives, school rules and reasonable requests.

**Professional Characteristics**
The intern demonstrates professional attitude, integrity, conduct and appearance within the educational environment.

**Staff Relations**
The intern exhibits a collegial and professional relationship with all staff.

**Parent-Community Relations**
The intern demonstrates the ability to convey the school’s mission, objectives, program and policies to parents and the community, and maintains positive and productive parent contact.

**Professional Development**
The intern utilizes opportunities for professional study and growth and employs ongoing reflection throughout the teaching/learning process.

The Columbus Education Association’s Peer Assistance and Review (PAR) is an award-winning teacher evaluation model for Ohio and the Nation.
Letter from CEA President

Fellow Educators,

Since its inception, the Columbus Public Schools Peer Assistance and Review Program has become a national model for teacher training. Under the leadership of former National Education Association President Bob Chase, the NEA passed a resolution encouraging local school districts to develop peer assistance and review programs to meet their own needs.

This has been true even though some of our local urban school systems have aggressively recruited. Yet, it has also resulted in the non-segregation of five to seven percent of the focus on education. The CEA remains committed to the goals of its founders as it looks toward the future of public education.

John E. Grossman
CEA President

---

About Columbus Public Schools

General Information

As of November 2000, 64,859 students were enrolled in the district's 143 schools and two English-as-a-Second-Language (ESL) Welcome Centers. More than 59 percent of the district’s students are African American; 36 percent are white, more than 2 percent are Asian; and a slight fraction are Native American. Approximately 3 percent receive ESL services, 12 percent Special Education services and an estimated 20 percent Gifted and Talented services.

Columbus employs 5,300 teachers, 304 administrators and 2,987 support staff employees, including instructional assistants. Approximately 23 percent of the teaching staff have a bachelor's degree, 31 percent have a bachelor's plus 30 hours; 34 percent have a master's degree; 10 percent have a master's degree plus 30 hours; and 1 percent have earned doctorates. Approximately 1 percent has the equivalent of the bachelor’s degree.

Fifty-five percent of Columbus teachers have 0-5 years of experience; 14 percent have 6-10 years; 15 percent have 11-15 years; 6 percent have 16-20 years; 9 percent have 21-25 years and 11 percent have more than 26 years. Male teachers comprise 22.7 percent of the total, while female teachers make up 77.3 percent.

The racial breakdown of the districts teaching staff is 76.6 percent white, 22.2 percent African American, 6 percent (5/3 of 1 percent) Spanish-American, and 5 percent (1/2 of 1 percent) Asian.

The Columbus Education Association

The Columbus Education Association can trace its origin back to the period immediately following the American Civil War. CEA was originally the outgrowth of two organizations. The Women's Teachers' Association of Columbus, Ohio was the oldest of the merging bodies. It was apparently organized in 1871. The Women's Teachers' Association espoused the goals of "enlightening society and building the profession."

The Columbus Men's Teachers' Alliance can be traced back to 1888. It held regular monthly business meetings. A recorded teacher's salary in 1894 was $375 a year.

In April of 1925, the two organizations came together and adopted the name of the Columbus Teacher Federation. In June of 1951, the name was changed to the Columbus Education Association.

In the late 1960's, the Association went through a major transition. It became more vocal about the profession. This activity culminated in the first written master agreement being approved in 1969-70. The CEA agreement was one of the first in Ohio. That same school year, a bargaining election was held and CEA was selected by 98.8% of the voting teachers over a rival group or a third choice of no representation.

CEA grew as an organization during the period between 1974 and 1978. A five-day strike in 1975 made it very clear that teachers would not work unless their concerns were dealt with fairly. Although a strike is always a time of difficulty and loss, teachers had firmly stood up and respect was strongly achieved.

John Grossman has been CEA President since 1978. In recent years, CEA has had to face desegregation, reductions in force and serious financial crises, but it continues to move forward. The Association has helped create a number of innovative programs that have received national attention.

A series of major educational reform projects have been started in the last eight years. This has helped keep Columbus teachers in a competitive position even though they work in a major urban district. The CEA remains committed to the goals of its founders as it looks toward the future of public education.