How Can Workforce Leaders Boost Job Quality?

The Aspen Institute Economic Opportunities Program
Agenda

Welcome
   Maureen Conway, The Aspen Institute Economic Opportunities Program

Webinar technology

Job Quality in Practice at EOP

Presentation by experts
   Mandy Townsend, JVS Boston
   Janice Urbanik, National Fund for Workforce Solutions
   Brooke Valle, San Diego Workforce Partnership

Q&A
Using Zoom

Webinar controls and assistance
- Attendees are muted
- Chat and Q&A functions are available at the bottom of the Zoom window. Move your cursor down and these functions will appear.
- If you have a technical issue, contact EOP using the chat box or via email, eop.program@aspeninst.org.
- Webinar is being recorded. Video and slides will be shared afterward.

Participation
- Volunteer! At any time, send questions for presenters via the Q&A box. We will take questions at the end.
Job Quality in Practice

With support from Prudential Financial, we are engaged in an effort to encourage the development of job quality practices that promote access to economic opportunity. In the coming months, we will provide actionable tools and guidance to support leaders across geographies and fields to engage in practical action to improve jobs in their local communities and connect to a growing national conversation.
Job Quality in Practice

Webinars
1. Assessing Job Quality and Equity in Your Local Labor Market: A Closer Look at Race, Gender, and Place
2. To Boost Job Quality, Money Matters: Practical Tools for Engaging Investors and Lenders Toward Change
3. How Can Workforce Leaders Boost Job Quality?
4. March 24 – Strengthening Frontline Management to Improve Job Quality
5. April 21 – Worker Voice as an Essential Element of Job Quality: Tools for Business and Advocates
6. May 12 – Promoting Worker Ownership and Improving Job Quality

Project Overview

Join our mailing list for upcoming webinars and announcements
as.pn/eopmail

March 3, 2020
Our Guests

Mandy Townsend
Vice President of Employer Engagement, JVS Boston
Job Quality Fellow, The Aspen Institute

Janice Urbanik
Senior Director for Innovation and Strategy, National Fund for Workforce Solutions

Brooke Valle
Chief Strategy and Innovation Officer, San Diego Workforce Partnership
Mandy Townsend
Vice President of Employer Engagement,
JVS Boston
Job Quality Fellow, The Aspen Institute
Job Quality In Practice

JVS Boston

Mandy Townsend, VP of Employer Engagement
1. To achieve economic mobility for clients and their families
2. To leverage tight market conditions to build good employer habits
3. To move the focus on good jobs from a hobby to our mission
How JVS Is Getting There

1. Conducted 3 Job Quality projects under NFWS grant
2. Created cross-agency Employer Engagement & JQ Team
3. Applying Job Quality Overlay on agency-wide employer engagement strategy
4. Doubling # of clients in quality jobs by 2022
5. Implementing a Job Quality Benchmarking Initiative
Job Quality Benchmarking Initiative Benefits

**Stakeholder Benefits:**

1. **Clients** – Faster economic mobility for job seekers and their families through access to higher quality jobs.
2. **Employers** – Access to comparative quantitative and qualitative data to increase competitiveness.
3. **JVS** – Ability to make data driven decisions around employer engagement to strategically deploy limited resources.
Job Quality Benchmarking Initiative Goals

1. Direct service staff can filter companies by pillar to find the “right fit” jobs for their clients.

2. Strategically focus our decision making & employer engagement on companies with higher quality jobs.

3. Increase our consultative efficacy by delivering data driven, customized feedback to employer partners, helping them compete for top talent.
Staff Surveys
- 126 individual surveys received of 182 total staff (69%)

Client Surveys
- 154 total respondents across 15 training programs/JVS departments
  - 92% of jobs held in US
  - Salary ranges from $14.00/hr to $59,000/yr
  - 67% female
  - 57% had HS diploma, some college or a Bachelors
Client Responses
1. Livable Wages
2. Scheduling Flexibility
3. Access to Benefits
4. Support Managers
5. Access to a Career Ladder

5 Pillars

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5 Pillars</th>
<th># of questions on survey</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Salary/Wage</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedule Flexibility/Predictability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Availability of Benefits</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supportive Work Environment</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to a Career Ladder</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Creation of Benchmarking Survey

34 Questions
Early Wins

• **Employer Practice Change**
  - **Wage Increases**
    - $3.00/hr wage increase negotiation due to benchmarking data
  - **Talent Pipeline Models (FY17 – FY20)**
    - 1 cycle to 13 cycles
    - $36,000 to $416,000
    - 12 clients to 117 clients
  - **Investment in ESOL as part of talent pipeline model**
  - **Combining Job Requisitions**
    - Collapse of 3 per diem/PT positions into 1 benefitted FTE
  - **Relaxing of inflexible hiring standards in healthcare**
Early Wins

• Client Outcomes
  • Increase in Wages
    • 52% increase in annual earnings ($13,000/year) for Pharm Techs
    • 25% increase in annual earnings ($6,400/year) for CNAs
  • Increase in Hours & Better Schedules
    • Secured stable healthcare scheduling with multiple employer partners
    • Pharm Techs 8 more hours/week
    • CNAs 5 more hours/week
Janice Urbanik
Senior Director for Innovation and Strategy,
National Fund for Workforce Solutions
A national nonprofit network of communities and business leaders investing in practices, policies and systems that improve business performance and economic lives of workers
CareerSTAT: A National Network

Promoting increased employer investment in frontline healthcare worker skill development and career advancement

Network Members

• Employers from across the continuum of care
• Healthcare industry partnerships
• Workforce intermediaries
• Philanthropy
CareerSTAT: A National Network

- Evidence-Based Best Practices
- Resource Center & Member Directory
- Peer Recognition Program
- Healthcare Workforce Development Academy
Understanding “Self Sufficiency”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family Size</th>
<th>100% Annual</th>
<th>200% Annual</th>
<th>200% Monthly</th>
<th>200% Hourly (2080 hrs/yr)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>$12,490</td>
<td>$24,980</td>
<td>$2,082</td>
<td>$12.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>$16,910</td>
<td>$33,820</td>
<td>$2,818</td>
<td>$16.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>$21,330</td>
<td>$42,660</td>
<td>$3,555</td>
<td>$20.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>$25,750</td>
<td>$51,500</td>
<td>$4,293</td>
<td>$24.76</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- 200% of FPL covers just the *basics* – food, rent, utilities. *Nothing* is left over for saving for college, or car repairs, or medical emergencies.

- In Cincinnati:
  - 52% of all families with children under 18, *married or not*, have a single wage-earner
  - 72% of all jobs in the region pay *less than* $51,500/year.
Simply Put…

This is a *job quality issue*, not a social service issue.

Solving the talent issue begins with focusing on creating more *economy-boosting jobs*.

Economy-boosting jobs pay people enough to maintain *spending* on the basics like utilities, repairs, doctor visits and so on, thereby boosting families, communities and local businesses in the process.

Henry Ford was right!
## National Fund Job Design Framework

### Foundational

- **Compensation**
  - Wages & benefits
  - Financial incentives
  - Employee loans
- **Fundamentals**
  - Safety
  - Fairness
  - Respect
  - Job security
  - Grievance procedure
- **Structure**
  - Open communication
  - Stable hours & scheduling

### Support

- **Training**
  - Entry-level
  - Specialized
- **Internal Assistance**
  - Supervisory training
  - Job coaching
  - Peer mentors
  - Team development
  - Financial counseling
- **External Linkages**
  - Tax credits
  - Childcare
  - Transportation

### Opportunity

- **Career Development**
  - Cross training
  - Advancement
  - Educational benefits
- **Acknowledgment**
  - Internal & external recognition
  - Leveling of perks
- **Engagement**
  - Participation/Self-management
- **Representation**
  - Pride
- **Ownership**

Find the complete framework on [nationalfund.org](http://nationalfund.org)
Gallup study – “Not Just a Job” Rothwell/Crabtree

**Chart 11**

**Importance vs. satisfaction ratings for all dimensions of job quality**

- Level of pay: 86% agree, 54% satisfied
- Employee benefits: 84% agree, 55% satisfied
- Having the power to change things: 77% agree, 48% satisfied
- Career advancement opportunities: 74% agree, 48% satisfied
- Enjoying your day-to-day work: 68% agree, 90% satisfied
- Job security: 73% agree, 91% satisfied
- Stable and predictable pay: 75% agree, 92% satisfied
- Having a sense of purpose: 89% agree, 75% satisfied
- Stable and predictable hours: 73% agree, 81% satisfied
- Control over hours and/or location: 70% agree, 66% satisfied
Thank you

Janice Urbanik
Senior Director of Innovation and Strategy, National Fund for Workforce Solutions
Jurbanik@nationalfund.org
Brooke Valle
Chief Strategy and Innovation Officer,
San Diego Workforce Partnership
Workforce Development Practices that Advance Job Quality

Brooke Valle
Chief Strategy and Innovation Officer
San Diego Workforce Partnership
brooke@workforce.org
Our Five Pillars

**Job Quality**
Not all jobs are created equal
We place individuals in and help businesses foster inclusive, sustainable work for all that provides living wages, supports employee growth and elevates businesses

**2Gen Solutions**
Multiple generations, transformational results
We design, support and run programs that address the needs of workers and their families

**Outcomes-Focused Funding**
Where money meets mission
We build and promote self-sustaining funding mechanisms that reward impact and fill access gaps

**Inclusive Business Growth**
A societal and economic imperative
We develop a skilled, inclusive, competitive workforce to promote economic growth for businesses and opportunity for all

**Population-Specific Interventions**
Human-centered services; population-level impact
We help drive change at the population level through the delivery of targeted services and by spreading evidence-based practices among collaborators
Five Pillar Goals – By 2025

As a result of our services:

1. **Job Quality**
   - 1.1) 100% of our job seekers receive training or coaching to determine what job quality means for them
   - 1.2) 80% of our internal placements and 100% of our staff are in a role that meets at least one job quality indicator per category (beyond wage)*
   - 1.3) 50 employer champions implement at least one new job quality feature (other than wage)**
   - 1.4) 100% of Workforce-issued subrecipient contracts contain job quality requirements
   - 1.5) At least one local, state or federal bill is passed that improves job quality (e.g. stable scheduling policies) in San Diego

2. **2Gen**
   - 2.1) 100% of our job seekers and our staff with children under 13 are supported to secure affordable, quality child-care
   - 2.2) 75% of parent job seeker households attain “self-sufficient” household income within 12 months of engagement with our programs
   - 2.3) 50 employers adopt at least one new family-friendly job quality feature as a result of our engagement**
   - 2.4) At least one local and one state measure is passed to improve availability of and access to child-care

3. **Outcomes Funding**
   - 3.1) 50% of Workforce-issued contracts are outcomes based
   - 3.2) Data is systematically collected across the organization to support outcome/ROI evaluation
   - 3.3) 25M evergreen Workforce ISA Fund created to support our priority sectors
   - 3.4) 5 paid/co-funded technical assistance projects on implementing outcomes approaches completed for other workforce organizations
   - 3.5) 90% of ISA program graduates attain employment above the minimum income threshold within 6 months
   - 3.6) At least one local, state or federal bill is passed to incentivize outcomes-focused funding of workforce programs

4. **Inclusive Growth**
   - 4.1) 50 employers in priority occupations implement changes to increase access to jobs by under-represented candidates
   - 4.2) Early workforce development in underrepresented communities is accelerated through Workforce/K-12 partnerships that cover at least 75% of SD County students
   - 4.3) 60% of internal training investments (e.g. ITA) are made in priority occupations
   - 4.4) 5 paid/co-funded engagements with businesses completed for new suite of employer lifecycle services
   - 4.5) Gender and race wage gaps in San Diego are tracked and reduced year over year

5. **Population Specific**
   - 5.1) 100% of our programs are data-informed and include evaluation approaches tailored to the population being served
   - 5.2) 85% satisfaction score from customers across all our programs when asked to confirm that we meet their unique needs
   - 5.3) Workforce development is co-funded by at least 2 new social service agencies as an intervention (e.g. as a key component to accelerate immigrant integration)
   - 5.4) 15M raised to support multi-year programs for priority populations (e.g. Opportunity Youth, Immigrants, Vets, Justice Involved)
   - 5.5) The amount of funding directly supporting participants (e.g. wages), as a % of grant total, is increased year over year across our programs

---

*Categories are Job Necessities, Job Opportunities, Job Features
**Goal 1.3 and Goal 2.3 are related. We should end up with a total of 100 employers who have implemented job quality features, at least 50 of the features implemented should be family friendly. It is possible that more than 50 will be but this is a baseline.
A quality job is a position that contributes to household stability through:

- Reliable, predictable earnings which provide a pathway to self-sufficiency for family size
- Working conditions that are safe, free from discrimination and harassment, and welcoming of workers’ concerns and ideas for improvement
- Opportunities to learn, grow and advance either within the organization or the field
- A set of support systems, benefits and options that aligns with the needs of a worker’s life circumstances and career goals

*Often these include benefits such as health insurance, paid sick and vacation time, family/medical leave, child care, an adequate retirement savings plan, disability insurance, life insurance, stable/predictable work hours and/or schedule flexibility and support systems such as training and development; however, desirability of specific supports and benefits will vary based on personal choice. See the job quality indicators for a range of different supports.
Understanding Job Quality

1. **Job Necessities**
   - **Raising the Floor**
     Job necessities are focused on creating environments for fair work. Indicators are often legally required, and a lack of necessities is detrimental to workers.

2. **Job Opportunities**
   - **Building Ladders**
     Job opportunities are focused on maximizing individual and organizational potential in order to achieve positive results for both the employer and employee (e.g. career and business growth, financial reward); equity and inclusion are key factors.

3. **Job Features**
   - **Empowering People**
     The value placed on job features varies by worker and needs may change over time. Indicators are individually weighted to produce a personal assessment of what is needed and can serve as key attraction and retention mechanisms for employers.
Job Quality Indicators

1. Job Necessities
   - 1.1 Living Wage
   - 1.2 Safe Working Conditions
   - 1.3 Appropriate Classification
   - 1.4 HR Infrastructure
   - 1.5 Stable Scheduling

2. Job Opportunities
   - 2.1 Performance Management
   - 2.2 Open Communication
   - 2.3 Learning and Development
   - 2.4 Empowerment and Support

3. Job Features
   - 3.1 Health and Wellness
   - 3.2 Food, Transportation and Housing
   - 3.3 Leave and Schedule Flexibility
   - 3.4 Employee Engagement
   - 3.5 Financial Supports
   - 3.6 Job Security
   - 3.7 Meaningful Work
Formula for Job Quality

1. Job Necessities
2. Job Opportunities
3. Job Features

A high-quality job is one that provides all the necessities, a path of opportunity as well as features that align well with the individual's goals and circumstances.

Circumstances
An individual's relevant context (e.g. education, experience, transportation options, family situation, barriers to employment)

Career Goals
What specifically an individual wants from their job both now and in the future (e.g. some prefer to maximize salary, others prefer a sense of purpose)
Job Quality in Action

- Procurement Processes
- Job Development and Job Matching
- Workforce Practitioner Roles
- Partner Collaboration (e.g. MOUs)
- Job Seeker Education
- Employer Outreach and Support
Q&A

Ask questions through the Q&A box
Job Quality in Practice

Webinars

1. Assessing Job Quality and Equity in Your Local Labor Market: A Closer Look at Race, Gender, and Place
2. To Boost Job Quality, Money Matters: Practical Tools for Engaging Investors and Lenders Toward Change
3. How Can Workforce Leaders Boost Job Quality?
4. March 24 – Strengthening Frontline Management to Improve Job Quality
5. April 21 – Worker Voice as an Essential Element of Job Quality: Tools for Business and Advocates
6. May 12 – Promoting Worker Ownership and Improving Job Quality

Project Overview

Join our mailing list for upcoming webinars and announcements
as.pn/eopmail

March 3, 2020 38